arXiv:1511.08864v1 [math.PR] 28 Nov 2015

A note on the "conditional triviality" property for regular conditional distributions

Julian Newman

December 1, 2015

Abstract

We make the simple, and yet deep, observation that a regular conditional distribution (rcd) almost surely trivialises the conditioning σ-algebra if and only if there exists a "measurable selection" of regular conditional distributions for almost all the measures arising out of the original rcd.

Let (X, Σ) be a countably generated measurable space, and let $\mathcal{P}$ be the set of probability measures on (X, Σ), equipped with its natural σ-algebra $\mathfrak{K} := \sigma(\mu \mapsto \mu(A) : A \in \Sigma)$. Given a probability measure $\rho \in \mathcal{P}$ and a sub-σ-algebra $\mathcal{G}$ of Σ, we will say that $\mathcal{G}$ is *ρ-trivial* if $\rho(G) \in \{0, 1\}$ for all $G \in \mathcal{G}$.

From now on, let ρ be a probability measure on (X, Σ), and let $\mathcal{G}$ be a sub-σ-algebra of Σ. (The restriction of ρ to $\mathcal{G}$, which is a probability measure on $(X, \mathcal{G})$, is denoted $\rho|_{\mathcal{G}}$.)

Definition 1. A *regular conditional distribution of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$* is a $(\mathcal{G}, \mathfrak{K})$-measurable function $\rho^{\mathcal{G}} : X \to \mathcal{P}$ such that for all $A \in \Sigma$ and $G \in \mathcal{G}$,

$$\rho(A \cap G) \;=\; \int_G \rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)(A)\, \rho(dx).$$

Since (X, Σ) is countably generated, it is easy to show (using the π-λ theorem) that if such a function $\rho^{\mathcal{G}} : X \to \mathcal{P}$ exists then it is $\rho|_{\mathcal{G}}$-essentially unique. It is also well-known that if (X, Σ) is standard, then such a function $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}$ *must* exist (see e.g. Theorem 33.3 of [1]).

From now on, $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}$ denotes a rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$.

Remark 2. Given any set S and a function $g : X \to S$, we will say that g is *ρ-almost constant* if there exists $c \in S$ such that $g(x) = c$ for ρ-almost all $x \in X$. It is clear (but still worth pointing out explicitly) that the following are equivalent: (i) $\mathcal{G}$ is ρ-trivial; (ii) the constant map $x \mapsto \rho$ is a rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$; (iii) $\rho^{\mathcal{G}} : X \to \mathcal{P}$ is ρ-almost constant.

Lemma 3. *For any $E \in \mathcal{G} \otimes \Sigma$,*

$$\rho(x \in X : (x, x) \in E) \;=\; \int_X \int_X \mathbb{1}_E(x, y)\, \rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)(dy)\, \rho(dx).$$

Proof. For any $G \in \mathcal{G}$ and $A \in \Sigma$,

$$\begin{aligned}\rho(x \in X : (x,x) \in G \times A) &= \rho(A \cap G) \\ &= \int_G \rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)(A)\, \rho(dx) \\ &= \int_X \int_X \mathbb{1}_{G\times A}(x,y)\, \rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)(dy)\, \rho(dx).\end{aligned}$$

So then, the collection $\mathcal{E}$ of sets $E \in \mathcal{G} \otimes \Sigma$ satisfying the desired result includes all sets of the form $G \times A$ (with $G \in \mathcal{G}$ and $A \in \Sigma$). But also, by the monotone convergence theorem, $\mathcal{E}$ is a λ-system. Hence the π-λ theorem gives that $\mathcal{E}$ is the whole of $\mathcal{G} \otimes \Sigma$. □

Definition 4. We will say that $\mathcal{G}$ *is conditionally trivial under* ρ if $\mathcal{G}$ is $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)$-trivial for ρ-almost all $x \in X$.

Remark 5. Note that this is weaker than saying that $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)|_{\mathcal{G}} = \delta_x|_{\mathcal{G}}$ for ρ-almost all $x \in X$. (For more on this latter condition, see [2], noting also the corrections in [3].) Conditional triviality has been considered in [4] and [5], and is also the key concept in the measure-theoretic versions of the "ergodic decomposition theorem" (see e.g. Theorem 10.1 of [6]). The following example (essentially taken from [4]) demonstrates that conditional triviality does not automatically hold: Let $X = [0,1] \times \{0,1\}$ (with $\Sigma = \mathcal{B}([0,1]) \otimes 2^{\{0,1\}}$), let ρ be a probability measure on X whose projection onto $[0,1]$ is atomless, and let $\mathcal{G} \subset \Sigma$ be the smallest σ-algebra containing both $\mathcal{B}([0,1]) \otimes \{\varnothing, \{0,1\}\}$ and all the Σ-measurable ρ-null sets. Then given any non-Dirac probability measure m on the binary set $\{0,1\}$, the function $\rho^{\mathcal{G}} : (x,i) \mapsto \delta_x \otimes m$ is a rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$. Clearly, for any $x \in [0,1]$, $\{(x,0)\} \in \mathcal{G}$; and yet, for all $(x,i) \in X$,

$$\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x,i)(\{(x,0)\}) = m(0) \in (0,1).$$

Definition 6. A function $\rho_2^{\mathcal{G}} : X \times X \to \mathcal{P}$ will be called an *iterated rcd of* ρ *given* $\mathcal{G}$ if for ρ-almost every $x \in X$, the map $y \mapsto \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,y)$ is a rcd of $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)$ given $\mathcal{G}$.

(Note that this definition is independent of the version of $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}$ that we are working with.)

Remark 7. If (X,Σ) is standard then the axiom of choice yields that there must exist an iterated rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$ (although we do not automatically know about the measurability properties thereof).

Theorem 8. *$\mathcal{G}$ is conditionally trivial under ρ if and only if there exists an iterated rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$ which is $(\mathcal{G} \otimes \mathcal{G}, \mathfrak{K})$-measurable.*

Proof. If $\mathcal{G}$ is conditionally trivial under ρ then (as in Remark 2) the map $(x,y) \mapsto \rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)$ is an iterated rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$, and it is obviously $(\mathcal{G} \otimes \mathcal{G}, \mathfrak{K})$-measurable. Conversely, suppose we have an iterated rcd $\rho_2^{\mathcal{G}} : X \times X \to \mathcal{P}$ of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$ which is $(\mathcal{G} \otimes \mathcal{G}, \mathfrak{K})$-measurable. For each $A \in \Sigma$ the set

$$E_A := \{(x,y) \in X \times X : \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,y)(A) = \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,x)(A)\}$$

is $(\mathcal{G} \otimes \mathcal{G})$-measurable. So, letting $\mathcal{A} \subset \Sigma$ be a countable π-system generating Σ, the set

$$E := \{(x,y) \in X \times X : \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,y) = \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,x)\} = \bigcap_{A \in \mathcal{A}} E_A$$

is $(\mathcal{G} \otimes \mathcal{G})$-measurable. Obviously E includes the whole of the diagonal in $X \times X$, and therefore (by Lemma 3)

$$\int_X \int_X \mathbb{1}_E(x,y)\, \rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)(dy)\, \rho(dx) \;=\; 1.$$

It follows that for ρ-almost all $x \in X$,

$$\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)(y \in X : \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,y) = \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,x)) \;=\; 1.$$

So, for ρ-almost every $x \in X$, the map $y \mapsto \rho_2^{\mathcal{G}}(x,y)$ is $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)$-almost constant. Thus (by Remark 2 applied to $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)$) $\mathcal{G}$ is $\rho^{\mathcal{G}}(x)$-trivial for ρ-almost all $x \in X$. □

Remark 9. In view of the above theorem, the fact that conditional triviality does not always hold serves to demonstrate the "non-measurability" (or, in heuristic terms, the "non-constructivity") of the operation of "conditioning with respect to a σ-algebra". (Indeed, conditional probabilities may be obtained as either Radon-Nikodym derivatives or orthogonal projections in $\mathcal{L}^2$, both of which are "non-constructively" proven to exist.) This point can be made slightly more precise as follows: Suppose $\mathcal{G}$ has the property that there exists a $(\mathfrak{K} \otimes \mathcal{G}, \mathfrak{K})$-measurable function $C^{\mathcal{G}} : \mathcal{P} \times X \to \mathcal{P}$ such that for all $\mu \in \mathcal{P}$ the map $x \mapsto C^{\mathcal{G}}(\mu, x)$ is a rcd of μ given $\mathcal{G}$; then the map $(x,y) \mapsto C^{\mathcal{G}}(C^{\mathcal{G}}(\rho,x),y)$ is clearly a $(\mathcal{G} \otimes \mathcal{G}, \mathfrak{K})$-measurable iterated rcd of ρ given $\mathcal{G}$, and therefore $\mathcal{G}$ is conditionally trivial under ρ.

Acknowledgement

The author would like to thank Prof Patrizia Berti and Prof Pietro Rigo for their helpful comments and kind encouragement.

References

[1] Billingsley, P., *Probability and Measure* (3rd ed.), Wiley, New York (1995).

[2] Seidenfeld, T., Schervish, M. J., Kadane, J. B., Improper Regular Conditional Distributions, *Ann. Prob.* **29**(4), pp1612–1624 (2001).

[3] Seidenfeld, T., Schervish, M. J., Kadane, J. B., Correction: Improper Regular Conditional Distributions, *Ann. Prob.* **34**(1), pp423–426 (2006).

[4] Berti, P., Rigo, P., 0-1 Laws for Regular Conditional Distributions, *Ann. Prob.* **35**(2), pp649–662 (2007).

[5] Berti, P., Rigo, P., A Conditional 0-1 Law for the Symmetric σ-field, *J. Theor. Probab.* **21**(3), pp517–526 (2008).

[6] Gray, R. M., *Probability, Random Processes, and Ergodic Properties* (2nd ed.), Springer, Dordrecht (2009).